

-----Original Message-----

From: XXX YYY<xxx@yyy.zzz>

Sent: Tue, Jun 11, 2013 at 1:08 AM

To: Managing Editor

Subject: RE: Request for final decision for manuscript number 2013_PRR1_4020

I think this m/s still needs some work to be done.

I am not sure about the abstract and conclusion parts since they appear to be of qualitative nature and I do not see any data for heavy metal concentration as well as on transfer factor. It is hard to make any comparison with studies published for other locations that contain data on these metals in mg/kg or ppm. Scientific conclusions should be supported by data.

I am not much in agreement of the authors' argument about 12 months studies for one M. Sc student and other student working on other seasons and that will be the second publication. Why not have two publications at the same time so effect of time could be compared if concentrations or transfer factors change with time.

The authors have listed the impact in terms of concentrations and transfer factor for heavy metals caused by dumping. However, I am not quite sure about any explanations given in the m/s as to why there is more As/Cd at one location than at another location. Last paragraph before conclusion refers to 'Reference 20' and says pH, climate change etc. would cause changes in concentrations. It would be nice if the authors could be more specific and cite some the local (site) factors they think are responsible for these variations due to material type dumped, site, rain, pH, CEC, etc. How time is going to effect has still to be seen.

I am sorry for sending these comments again, but those are my personal views based on what I see are missing. The chief editor might have different views.

Editor's Details:

G. S. Rahi

Department of Natural Sciences,

Fayetteville State University, NC, USA

Note: Modification was done in this email ONLY to hide the identity.